

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange: The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

Patricia Sippel*

要約

本稿はカナダ・メソジスト教会婦人伝道会社に派遣され、東洋英和女学校の初期を形成した三人の女性伝道者たちの異文化交流に焦点を当てる。創立者であるマーサー・J・カートメル(1845-1945)の滞在期間は病気により短いものとなった。イライザ・スペンサー・ラージ(1855-1933)は、校舎において目の前で夫を殺害され、後には日本におけるカナダ・メソジスト伝道運動を脅かすほどの闘いに挑むこととなる。そしてアグネス・ウイントミュート・コーツ(1864-1945)は、当初伝道のために精力的な活動をするも、来る戦時期には長きにわたる疎外と孤独な死が彼女を待ち受けていた。書簡、報告書、議事録を紐解いていくことで、日本という生活環境そして布教の地でカナダ人伝道者たちが経験した国際交流の複雑さを素描する。

キーワード：婦人伝道会社、カナダ・メソジスト教会、国際交流、女子教育

Keywords : Woman's Missionary Society , Methodist Church of Canada, international exchange, girls' education

* 東洋英和女学院大学 国際社会学部 教授
Professor, Faculty of Social Science, Toyo Eiwa University

I. Introduction

On December 27, 1882, Martha Julia Cartmell of Hamilton, Ontario, arrived in Yokohama as the first overseas representative of the newly founded Woman's Missionary Society of the Methodist Church of Canada. Her mission was to advance the spread of Christianity in Japan by focusing on the needs of women and girls. Less than two years later and with the help of Canadian and Japanese Methodists already active in the Tokyo area, Cartmell had taken an important step toward accomplishing her goal. In October 1884, she opened a girls' school, Toyo Eiwa Jogakko, in the Azabu district of Tokyo. Set thus in motion by the Christianizing aspirations of Methodist women in a distant part of the globe, Toyo Eiwa was from its earliest years an educational and even a financial success, attracting enrolments from the families of Japan's political and cultural elite while at the same time reaching out to poorer children. Through the early decades of the 20th century, the school developed a program that included elementary, high school, and college preparatory departments. It gained attention for the high social status of its pupils, for its progressive, Western-style curriculum, for its modern facilities, and for the international environment created and sustained by the Canadian women who followed Cartmell as missionary educators.

While Toyo Eiwa's international character was a crucial element of its success in the first half-century of its history, that same internationalism also produced challenges and stresses. In the school's earliest years, Japanese staff struggled to implement unfamiliar educational content and methods in an environment of strict Christian evangelism. Later, Japanese and Canadian school administrators had to adjust to the increasingly rigid demands of the modern Japanese educational system. As the school matured

in the 1920s, the question of when and how leadership would be handed over to the "native teachers" emerged. And from the 1930s, forced compliance with the ultra-nationalistic and militarist policies of the Japanese state threatened Toyo Eiwa's survival as a Christian institution.

But beyond these issues, which unfolded in ways that mirrored Japan's development as a modern state, were the complex, more intimate, and probably more deeply felt interactions experienced by the Canadian missionary women in their Japanese living and work environment. Even among those who enjoyed long and productive careers as teachers and administrators at Toyo Eiwa, the personal and professional challenges were enormous. Many struggled to maintain their health and a sense of wellbeing while engaging with unfamiliar, or unacceptable cultural norms. Some were embroiled in a near-disastrous conflict with male missionaries. A few felt the fear of physical danger. There was even rare disenchantment with the ideals that had brought them to Japan. These experiences of Canadian women living in an international environment were interlaced with issues of gender, status, and religious and professional commitment in ways that go beyond any simple definition of international exchange.

This paper will examine Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a site of international exchange, focusing on the experiences – some private, some all too public – of three Canadian women missionaries who shaped the first half-century of its history: Martha Cartmell (1845-1945), the school's founder, whose time at Toyo Eiwa was cut short by psychological illness; Eliza Spencer Large (1855-1933), whose husband was murdered before her eyes in their residence and who later engaged in a rancorous battle between male and female missionaries that threatened the success of the Methodist missionary enterprise in Japan;

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

and Agnes Wintemute Coates (1864-1945), whose early vigorous efforts on behalf of the mission were followed by long years of alienation and a lonely death in wartime Japan. The paper draws on materials in the Toyo Eiwa Jogakuin archives¹, on documents in the United Church of Canada Archives in Toronto², on official histories of Toyo Eiwa Jogakuin³ and the Methodist missionary movement⁴ and on the work of Canadian historians of gender and religion.⁵ In each of these sources, the most revealing insights come from the letters, reports and deliberations of the missionaries and their Methodist supporters in Canada.

II. The Woman's Missionary Society in Japan (1881-1925)

The foundation, financial support, and leadership of Toyo Eiwa Jogakko were the first and best-known international achievements of the Woman's Missionary Society (WMS) of the Methodist Church of Canada. The WMS was founded in 1881 in Hamilton, Ontario, in response to a growing wave of enthusiasm among Methodist women for active involvement in the evangelical work of the Church, both at home and abroad.⁶ After general agreement to form a missionary society was reached at a meeting of the Central Missionary Board in June 1880, a planning meeting held in April 1881 determined that the objectives of the society would be "to engage the efforts of Christian women in the evangelization of heathen women and children; to aid in sustaining female Missionaries and Teachers, or other special laborers, in foreign or home fields; and to raise funds for the work."⁷ Evangelical activities, at home and abroad, were approved at the foundation meeting of the WMS held at the Wesleyan Female College in Hamilton on November 9, 1881. They remained the main focus of the society until

1925, when the formation of the United Church of Canada ended the WMS as a separate organization. During those 44 years, the WMS employed some 307 paid representatives: some 81 were appointed to the Japan mission, including Toyo Eiwa; another 81 were sent to the West China mission based in Szechwan Province; and about 142 worked in Canadian "home" missions located in Quebec, Ontario, British Columbia and Alberta.⁸

The specific focus directed by the WMS on Japan grew out of the activities of the broader Methodist community in Canada, and particularly the decision of the Wesleyan Methodist Church to focus on Japan as its first overseas mission field from 1873.⁹ Led by Davidson MacDonald and George Cochran, the Canadian Methodist mission achieved significant successes in evangelizing young Japanese men during the 1870s, but they felt hampered by the absence of women missionaries who could do the "work among the women that *only women* could do."¹⁰ In the context of such appeals, it was not surprising that, of the four mission activities discussed and approved at the inaugural WMS meeting of November 1881, the single overseas proposal read specifically: "That we engage to support a lady missionary to Japan."¹¹ Just over a year later, Martha Cartmell arrived in Japan to begin that work, and within three years, Toyo Eiwa Jogakko was in operation. Building on the success of Toyo Eiwa, the WMS founded a girls' school at Shizuoka in 1887 and in Kofu, Yamanashi Prefecture, two years later. Other short-lived enterprises included an orphanage and two industrial schools in Kanazawa Prefecture and a school and kindergarten in Nagano Prefecture. Wherever they worked, the WMS representatives held Bible and Sunday school classes, helped the poor, and tended to the sick, striving in all activities to foster a

“Japanese Christian womanhood.”¹²

WMS missionaries, recruited through personal recommendations and advertisements in church publications, were required to be single, aged between 22 and 30 years, in good health, and willing to serve for at least five years.¹³ (From the mid-1890s, the minimum age was raised to 25.) Applicants who met the basic requirements were further screened by the society’s Board of Managers for their educational qualifications, work experience, moral character, and spiritual commitment. After the establishment of the Methodist Training School in Toronto in 1894, all prospective missionaries were required to study there for at least a term. According to Gagan, WMS missionary personnel were, on average, significantly better educated than their Canadian peers, and the best educated were normally sent to Japan in consideration of the high cultural level of the Japanese and the elite status of the Eiwa schools.¹⁴ By the turn of the 20th century, the WMS actively sought women who were university graduates and proficient in foreign languages. Among those recruited for the Japan mission after World War I, some 46% had university degrees, notably from Mt. Allison University (in Sackville, New Brunswick) and Victoria University (in Toronto). Nearly a quarter of those sent to Japan had some musical training. About 184, or 60% of all WMS missionaries came from Ontario, birthplace of the society; about 64, or just over 20%, were from the Maritime provinces, especially Nova Scotia. In the opening decades of the 20th century, a significant number were daughters, granddaughters, or widows of Methodist ministers or Church personnel.

One further characteristic of the WMS should be noted: its financial power and de facto independence of the General Board of Missions, which was male-run and hired the male repre-

sentatives.¹⁵ At the society’s inaugural meeting, members contributed more than a thousand dollars in 25-dollar life memberships. As its membership increased – to 26,741 in 1906 and 61,049 in 1925 – so did its fundraising capacity. In its lifetime, the WMS raised a total of more than 6.5 million dollars; it had well over a million dollars in assets at dissolution in 1925. Although technically subject to the General Board, the women guarded their decision-making powers and their money carefully. Consequently, they were able to expand operations in Japan, while paying relatively generous salaries to the representatives. For those stationed in Japan, annual salaries ranged between 500 and 750 dollars in the early years, rising to between 750 and 900 dollars in the 1920s. Gagan notes that a missionary career offered economic independence for unmarried, educated, middle-class women, who in some cases sent back a portion of their earnings to support family members in Canada.

III. Martha Cartmell: “standing alone”

Following its first formal meeting of November 1881, the WMS moved immediately to send its own representative to Japan. The November issue of *Missionary Outlook* carried an advertisement (“A Young Lady is Wanted! To Japan”), urging those interested to write to the WMS corresponding secretary, Elizabeth Strachan.¹⁶ Already, however, Martha Cartmell, who had participated actively in the establishment of the WMS, was the favored candidate. Minutes of the Board of Management meeting held on December 6, 1881, to discuss the proposed Japan mission, note that a Mrs. Clark moved that Cartmell be asked to go¹⁷, and successive meetings discussed the handling of funds to support one or two representatives. At the first annual meeting of the WMS held at Centenary Church, Hamilton, in September 1882, Cartmell was confirmed

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

as the first representative to Japan. Aged 37, Cartmell was older than the guidelines called for, but she was a person of great personal piety, an active member of Hamilton's Methodist community, a founding member of the WMS, and a cousin of Strachan, its corresponding secretary.¹⁸ Cartmell was also an experienced educator: after graduating in arithmetic and French from a girls' normal school in Toronto, she had begun teaching at a public girls' school in Hamilton in 1865 and was later promoted to principal.

Cartmell's selection as WMS representative to Japan was heralded in Hamilton. Church members and friends showered her with gifts, together with expressions of admiration and sympathy.¹⁹ After weeks of careful preparations, Cartmell departed with trunks of clothing, shoes, books, and jewelry as well as a desk, chest, bedding, cooking utensils, and a coal-oil stove. Arrangements were also made to send an organ. The trip took Cartmell to Buffalo, New York, where she met the American missionaries who were to act as her chaperones for the journey by train to San Francisco and across the Pacific in the steamer, *City of Tokio*. Two days after Christmas 1882, Cartmell disembarked at Yokohama. She had turned 38 earlier in the month. (It was a sign of future troubles that even before she left the United States, Cartmell was burdened with homesickness and doubts about her own abilities.²⁰) Once in Tokyo, however, she met members of the Canadian Methodist General Board of Missions – married men with families – and spent her first days in the Tsukiji home of mission leader Davidson Macdonald.

As WMS representative, Cartmell served diligently, studying Japanese, helping in Sunday school and women's groups at Macdonald's Tsukiji Church, and visiting the sick.²¹ She also held English Bible classes for a group of young

men, many of whom were later baptized. But Cartmell was convinced that the most effective way of evangelizing Japanese women was through the establishment of a girls' school that would permit ongoing interaction between Christian teachers, the pupils, and their families. In the summer of 1883, when the General Mission bought land in a "healthful and desirable location"²² of Tokyo to build its boys' school, Macdonald offered to secure the adjacent plot for the WMS. Cartmell accepted instantly – and then informed the WMS of the thousand-dollar commitment. Such was the trust in Cartmell and the support for the school she was planning to build that the WMS President, Sarah Gooderham, arranged for funds to be sent immediately.²³ Although the original plan was for a day school, Cartmell had come to believe that a boarding school, "where girls could be kept under constant Christian influences,"²⁴ would be necessary. Throughout 1884 she oversaw construction of a school building that would house two missionaries and about 50 students, including 24 boarders. She worked on the proposed curriculum and on the submission of documents to the governor of Tokyo. Since foreigners were not permitted to own land or school, a company of four Japanese Methodist ministers was set up by four Japanese Methodist ministers, of whom one was designated "school owner (*kōshu*)."

In October 1884, Toyo Eiwa Jogakko opened with Cartmell as principal; it was located at No. 14 Toriizaka, next to the similar-sounding Toyo Eiwa Gakko, which the Canadian Methodist General Board of Missions had opened for boys that same year with George Cochran as principal.²⁵ Although the girls' school had only two students (housed in temporary quarters) on opening day, Cartmell wrote to the WMS in April 1885 that she had at least 35 students and was expecting more; for this reason, she requested

funds to build a dining-room and kitchen, with rooms above, in the summer.²⁶ In July, she wrote that the projected enrolment increases made it likely that tuition and other fees would cover the salaries of the Japanese teachers, while at the same time repeating her request for support to expand the school facilities.²⁷ For its part, the WMS advertised the achievements of the school in order to elicit donations that could be used for capital expenses and for sending additional missionary representatives to the school.

Cartmell designed a progressive and challenging curriculum that included Japanese and English languages, mathematics, science (especially biology), and history. As the school grew, so did its offerings. The first meeting of the Board of Directors held at the school in 1891 focused almost exclusively on reports on the “course of study” and approved the hiring of teachers for koto, embroidery, sewing, piano, organ, “Japanese kokugo”, science, and pedagogy.²⁸ The educational program was gradually lengthened to include primary and middle school sections, and a three-year pre-college program, which the 1909 Board of Directors minutes referred to as the “crown of the whole curriculum.”²⁹ Religious instruction included daily Bible classes as well as compulsory attendance at Sunday worship services. Pupils were also encouraged to take part in Christian outreach, visiting poor families in the Azabu area. In addition, a number of low-income pupils who were given scholarships to study at the school, often as boarders; after graduation they were expected to spend two years as Bible teachers.

As Toyo Eiwa developed into a successful and well-respected school, Methodist accounts of its history came to stress the providential and heroic nature of its foundation. Cartmell’s achievement was celebrated as a cause of pride, not just for the WMS but also for the entire Methodist

missionary movement. Updates on the school were published frequently in publications such as *Missionary Outlook*, and the story of its foundation was included in every overview of Methodist missionary achievement in Asia. Volume 2 of *The Story of the Years*, written in 1909 by WMS member Harriett Platt, described the progress of the school in detail and praised the achievements of “our wise, refined and consecrated Miss Martha J. Cartmell,” especially during “the two years in which she stood alone and laid the foundation of our work in Japan.”³⁰ *Fruits of Christian Missions in Japan*, published by the United Church of Canada in 1930, carried an illustrated description of Toyo Eiwa inside the back cover. Echoing Platt’s words, it paid special tribute was Cartmell.³¹

It was late in the year 1882 that Miss Cartmell of Hamilton, Ontario, was sent by the Woman’s Missionary Society of the Methodist Church, Canada, in response to the request that had come for women missionaries for the Japan work from Dr. MacDonald and Dr. Cochran. They had won response from the Japanese men but it was impossible to get access to their homes. There was work that only women could do.

The story of the first two years in which Miss Cartmell, standing alone, laid the foundations of the Canadian Woman’s work in Japan, is one that will live forever in the life of the Christian Church. Though not strong physically, and hampered of course by insufficient knowledge of the language, she had an eminent fitness of character and consecration of life that attracted those who came in touch with her and won for herself, as well as for her Master, the love and allegiance of many, some of whom are still here and speak of her with deep affection and gratitude, though thirty-four years

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

have passed since her enforced retirement from the field.

Included in such testimonials was an acknowledgement of the heavy toll that the foundation of Toyo Eiwa had taken on Cartmell's health and wellbeing. Intellectually gifted and inspired by the highest level of evangelical and educational commitment, Cartmell was also sensitive, socially withdrawn, and filled with self-doubts that haunted her even before she arrived in Japan. At a personal level, intercultural exchange did not come easily: especially in her early days in Japan, she encountered difficulties with Japanese food, felt keenly her inadequacies in Japanese language, and confessed to a separation from Japanese culture.³²

Few can realize the sense of utter helplessness and inability to do anything that oppresses a missionary entering a new field.

Everything is strange, you are separated from those you wish to attract to yourself by race prejudices, habits and customs, which if not respected widen the breach, and more particularly by the language.

Although treated kindly by the married Canadian missionaries (such as Macdonald) and their families, Cartmell spoke of no particularly close friendships in her first year. Above all, "standing alone" as the only WMS representative in Japan, she found the responsibilities associated with setting up the new school draining rather than exhilarating.

Like many other educated women of her generation, Cartmell expressed her feelings in written communications – in her case, to friends and supporters in Canada. For example, in a series of letters dated September 15 through October 20, 1884, she described the stressful weeks leading up to the school's opening, beginning with a catastrophic typhoon on September 15. Alone in the new girls' building, Cartmell was terrified by

the ferocity of the wind and rain: "I sang hymns to make things a little more cheery, and to strengthen my own heart."³³ Learning later that hardly a house in the neighborhood had escaped damage and that the dining room of the Toyo Eiwa boys' school had been reduced to "a heap of ruins," Cartmell felt as if "I could hardly cheer myself up after such a catastrophe."

Yet the stress caused by natural disasters – the typhoon was followed by a fire on October 6 and earthquakes on October 10 and 16 – did not compare to the deep sense of spiritual emptiness that threatened to overwhelm Cartmell. On October 8, the day after the dedication of the school chapel, she wrote:³⁴

[In] the midst of the secular cares that consume time and energy at present my heart feels hungry. When you pray for missionaries, don't forget that those who are grappling with the language, and the wives and children who have not had an opportunity to learn it, get very little spiritual food in the native services. I felt this so much yesterday at the dedication of the chapel – so much to distract the attention. I understood the text, but received few ideas from the sermon. Listening for familiar words and the hunt through memory for the English do not inspire devotion.

Cartmell had been much encouraged by the decision of the WMS Board in October 1884 to send Eliza Spencer, an experienced teacher, as its second representative in Japan: "I am so eager to know about Miss Spencer....Her arrival will make quite a different world to me."³⁵ Indeed, Spencer, a 30-year-old former teacher from Paris, Ontario, who reached Tokyo in February 1885, proved to be energetic, companionable, and positive about her Japanese living environment. But neither Spencer's support nor the obvious success of the school relieved Cart-

mell's stress. At the end of summer 1885, she was forced to take a period of rest at the spa town of Miyanoshita, near Hakone, leaving Spencer to take over as school principal. She recovered sufficiently to make a brief return in the autumn, but her condition rapidly worsened and she was obliged to seek refuge again in Miyanoshita. Cartmell spent the following year in a vain effort to restore her health while maintaining correspondence with the WMS in Canada.³⁶ In February 1887, the Executive Committee of the WMS Board considered her letter of resignation with "deepest sympathy" and resolved not to accept it "unless her health makes it absolutely necessary."³⁷ The Committee was later informed that Cartmell had returned home on May 28.

In correspondence to WMS leaders and others in Canada, both Cartmell and Spencer tried to explain – for themselves as well as their readers – Cartmell's illness in the context of the psychological burden of the work in Japan. Each raised similar themes: the sheer volume of work, the stress of using and studying a foreign language, and the ill-defined "head trouble." Writing in September 1885 to break the news of her illness to relatives and friends, Cartmell revealed that she had been struggling with the condition for some time: "I worried myself trying to prove it was not true, or, if true, to find some excuse. My distress was so great I was afraid I would bring upon myself the worst form of head trouble."³⁸ Although she begged her countrywomen not to blame overwork as the cause of her illness, Cartmell referred repeatedly to the exhausting demands of the Japan mission, noting that people in Canada "could hardly know how the work takes hold of head and heart."³⁹ She urged them not to worry about her, adding grimly: "It is enough for me to see first the darkest side, and all the awful probabilities and possibilities."⁴⁰

Spencer had been concerned about Cartmell since her first days in Japan. On arrival in March 1885, she had written to the WMS: "From the prospect of things, I did not get here any too soon; poor Miss C. has too much on her hands."⁴¹ In September she wrote to Strachan, Cartmell's cousin and WMS corresponding secretary, that she had long worried that Cartmell "was doing more than most persons could do without injury to their health."⁴²

Spencer had tried vainly to get Cartmell to rest:

You who know her so well, will understand how hard it is for her to be idle, more especially here, where the work presses on every hand until you long for more heads and hands, and for days twice as long. The desire to talk with the people leads one to forget that in the study of the language much strength is exhausted.

Learning from Cartmell during a summer trip, however, that "her head still troubled her," Spencer had persuaded Cartmell to seek medical help. It was this consultation that led to Cartmell's first period of rest at Miyanshita. On Christmas Day 1885, Spencer informed the WMS of Cartmell's return to work, subsequent relapse, and second convalescence stay at Miyanoshita.⁴³

The trial of being laid aside from active work has been a great one; the burden rested heavily for a long time; of late there has been a perfect resignation and waiting for the Master's will to be made known.

As I write I feel how poorly my words can make you understand the matter. No one can understand the way in which this head trouble acts, unless they have seen it in some one.

Cartmell experienced her illness and inability to work as a spiritual as well as a physical crisis. She felt deep distress and guilt about her

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

enforced withdrawal to Canada in 1887. She returned to the Japan mission in 1892, focusing on pastoral work rather than education, but left in 1895, ostensibly to look after her ailing sister but probably more because of poor health. Cartmell spent her later years in Hamilton, living with her cousins. She died in Hamilton in March 1945, aged 99. Although she continued to blame herself for failing to endure the stresses of life in Japan, she remained an active, much honored supporter of the Japan mission. Indeed, rather than diminish her reputation, Cartmell's personal difficulties became part of a missionary narrative that emphasized the exceptional challenges of living and working in Japan. I will return to this point in the Conclusion.

IV. Eliza Spencer Large: Violence and Conflict

When Cartmell left Japan in 1887, the work of leading Toyo Eiwa Jogakko fell to a growing number of new WMS recruits, including Spencer, two daughters of the General Board missionary Cochran, a young Agnes Wintemute, who had arrived in 1886 from St. Thomas, Ontario, and Hannah Lund of Woodstock, Ontario. Oldest of the group and principal of the school since the autumn of 1885, Spencer was the undisputed leader.⁴⁴ She had been chosen by the WMS in preference to other candidates specifically because of her training as a teacher⁴⁵ and in contrast with the anxious tone of Cartmell's writings, her letters and reports reflected competent and confident management. Spencer was also more outgoing socially. In July 1887, just months after Cartmell's departure, she married the Rev. Alfred Large (1859-1890), who was several years younger and a General Board missionary teacher at the Toyo Eiwa boys' school. Although WMS rules stipulated that representatives give up paid work upon marriage, such was

Spencer's perceived importance to Toyo Eiwa that she was permitted to remain as a full-time, paid missionary in charge of the school.⁴⁶ And despite some malicious gossip surrounding the wedding in the Tokyo missionary community, the Rev. Large moved into the girls' school to live with his wife. Their daughter Kate was born in 1889.

At Toyo Eiwa Jogakko, Eliza Spencer Large thus appeared to enjoy a life that most women of her generation – in Japan or in Canada – could not aspire to: she pursued a satisfying career as a respected principal, supported by a loving husband and blessed with a child. This changed on the night of April 4, 1890, when two masked men broke into the school residence and murdered Alfred Large in a vicious sword attack; Eliza was seriously injured. In its account of "The Tragedy at the Toyo Gakko," the *Japan Weekly Mail* reported that the intruders had broken into the school shortly after 11:00 p.m., and demanded that the night watchman hand over the keys to the safe.⁴⁷ Inexplicably, the watchman led them upstairs to the Large bedroom and disappeared. Eliza woke and asked the two intruders what they wanted ("*nan deska*"); one answered that they had business ("*yoji-ga-aruru*"). Woken by the exchange, Alfred jumped to his feet and attempted barehanded to force the two sword-wielding attackers out of the room. He had pushed one into the corridor and almost over the balustrade when the attacks of the other disabled him. Alfred died on the spot of many wounds – detailed gruesomely in the newspaper account – to his head, heart, and shoulder. Eliza, who had placed herself between the attacker and her husband in a vain attempt to protect him, also received life-threatening wounds. Undaunted, she instructed the fearful Misses Nellie and Lizzie Hart, who occupied single rooms along the same corridor, to minister to

her dead husband and then to stem the bleeding from her own injuries. She lost two fingers as a result of the attack, and was left with a terrible gash on her face. The assailants were never caught.

These shocking events, detailed in the Japanese press and relayed to Canada, unnerved the school community, foreigners in Japan, and Methodists everywhere. As a result of the unfavorable publicity, enrolments at Toyo Eiwa dropped.⁴⁸ There was much discussion about whether the attacks were prompted by anti-foreign or anti-Christian sentiment, or whether an unprotected foreign girls' school in an expensive part of the city was simply an obvious target for robbers. The Christian community in Tokyo chose to emphasize the latter⁴⁹, but subsequent histories of the mission movement recounted the incident in the context of the particular, and usually unrecognized, difficulties of the Japan mission.⁵⁰ Cartmell warned Canadians against an overly "romantic and sentimental" view of Japan.⁵¹

Eliza Large was widely commended for her heroism and offered a year's furlough in Canada to recover.⁵² Isabella Blackmore (1863-1942) took over as third principal. *The Story of the Years*, ever sympathetic to the WMS representatives, recorded: "The home-coming of Mrs. Large, though sad, accomplished a great deal for our Society. She bravely took her place in the annual meetings and pleaded for Japan, the land of her adoption; the scarred face and maimed hand adding to the pathos of her appeal."⁵³ By the end of the year, however, stress had taken its toll, and Large spent several weeks at Clifton Springs Sanitarium, near Rochester, New York.⁵⁴ In July 1891, she returned with Kate to Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as teacher, though no longer principal.

By the time of Large's return, strains were

apparent in the relationship between the two branches of the Canadian Methodist missionary community in Japan: the WMS, which sponsored the female paid representatives, and the General Board which appointed the men and which oversaw the entire Canadian Methodist mission activity.⁵⁵ Although the two groups had originally enjoyed close informal relationships, their organizations had formalized along separate lines. Differences emerged, especially over the questions of whether and under what circumstances the WMS women should help the General Board men. Although later interpretations of what came to be known in Canadian Methodist circles as the "Imbroglia" or "Japan Affair" differed, all accepted that it was basically a conflict over gender roles. The men clung to a notion – already becoming outmoded among their Canadian peers—that the women (their spouses as well as the WMS representatives) were responsible for supporting them in various pastoral activities. The WMS representatives resisted their demands.

As the most senior WMS representative and the widow of a General Board missionary, Large might have been expected to play a mediating role. Instead, she led the WMS representatives in defying the men, defending WMS autonomy and professionalism in increasingly strident terms. Between 1891 and 1895, a series of disputes erupted between the two groups. Each leveled bitter accusations at the other and filed complaints with their respective boards in Canada. At various times, the WMS forbade its members to communicate with certain of the male missionaries. The women continued the battle, indignant (as they explained in a later defense of their actions) that

...a band of women, mostly experienced in various lines of Christian work before leaving home, should be so lacking in strength

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

of character as to submit to unjust treatment of themselves or stand passively by and see it imposed on others, or should be so lacking in integrity as to refrain from expressing conscientious convictions on all vital points.⁵⁶

The personal attacks on Large were particularly harsh, even when couched in seemingly sympathetic terms. Often, her emotional stability was questioned. One male antagonist suggested to Large – in a letter that arrived on the anniversary of her husband's death – that “the phantom that has embittered your life is ‘self-protection.’ As a lone lady in a hard world this has formed one of the chief elements of your anxiety.”⁵⁷ Even among the women, there were rumors that Large had mistreated some of the younger WMS representatives. On several occasions, Large submitted her resignation; each time the WMS refused to accept it.

In 1895, as the entire Canadian Methodist enterprise in Japan threatened to implode, the WMS and the General Board of Missions recalled Large and two senior male missionaries, F.A. Cassidy and Charles S. Eby, to Canada for a full investigation. Following extensive hearings that revealed much painful truth, a tribunal voted reluctantly to suspend all three from their positions in the Japan mission. (A separate inquiry by the WMS had already revealed that Large had used hypnosis on some of the women representatives and had confined one, Hannah Lund, to her room with only bread and water because she feared she might have diphtheria. Lund died in 1894 while on home leave in Canada.⁵⁸)

Although later official histories insisted that there was “no stain on the character of any of the missionaries,”⁵⁹ the very public dissension inflicted serious damage on the Canadian Methodist mission in Japan. A distraught Martha Cartmell wrote: “It seems as if Satan had been

let loose to rend and destroy the church.”⁶⁰ The outcome of the tribunal added a final blow to Large's career as WMS representative in Japan.⁶¹ Most of the women missionaries in Japan supported Large fiercely, and Blackmore especially continued to fight for her reinstatement at Toyo Eiwa. Large herself insisted that God was calling her to Japan.

Although the WMS leadership was sympathetic to Large's situation, the most senior members of the Church in Canada resisted. Frustrated over the impasse, WMS President Sarah Gooderham resigned, and in 1897 accompanied Large on a trip to Japan. In 1898, Large was named resident missionary for the world organization of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union. After difficult (and often unrewarding) efforts to control alcohol abuse and prostitution in Japan, Large retired in 1901 to Orrtanna, near Gettysburg, Pennsylvania, where, in her 56th year, she began a new life as a fruit farmer. In 1909, in response to her repeated petitions, the WMS awarded her a pension in view of her difficult economic circumstances. Although WMS publications continued to praise Large's contributions to Toyo Eiwa Jogakko and avoided linking her name to the Imbroglio, Large was unforgiving. She blamed the WMS as well as the General Board for wrecking her life and that of her daughter Kate. Large died in Pennsylvania in 1933, her 78th year.⁶²

V. Agnes Wintemute Coates: Moving Away

One of Eliza Large's most outspoken female critics during the Imbroglio was (Sarah) Agnes Wintemute Coates, her former subordinate at Toyo Eiwa and since 1893 the wife of a General Board missionary.⁶³ Wintemute, whose intelligence, independence, and feisty sense of purpose rivaled Large's own, was named overseas

missionary of the WMS in 1886 and assigned to work at Toyo Eiwa.⁶⁴ When she arrived in September of that year, Cartmell was in poor health, while Large was school principal and the dominant WMS personality. Like Cartmell and Large, Wintemute was a trained teacher. In fact, she had the highest level of formal education among the three, having followed her normal school studies in Ontario with a Mistress of Liberal Arts degree from Alma College, a Methodist women's academy in St. Thomas. She had taught for a year in a country school in Ontario when she was 18 and had been offered a teaching job at Alma College on graduation. Just 21 when she was appointed in April 1886, she was also the youngest of the three on arrival in Japan.

Unlike Cartmell, who had been beset by self-doubt throughout her journey to Japan, Wintemute was apparently able to throw off her anxieties and enjoy the trip.⁶⁵ She wrote what the *Missionary Outlook* called "a racy description" of her trip across the United States, including a visit to Chinatown in San Francisco.⁶⁶ Her youthful enthusiasm was evident in her detailed account of her arrival in Japan.⁶⁷ In a letter signed simply "Aggie" (rather than the customary "A. Wintemute" or even "Agnes Wintemute"), Wintemute described the "jabbering" Chinese steerage passengers at Yokohama and the Japanese couple "who had left all their clothes at home." She noted that other Japanese people wore "straw suits...very much the shape of the fur capes our ladies wear at home in the winter" and declared them to be "a very barbarous looking costume." She was delighted to be met at Yokohama by Cartmell and Cochran, was fascinated by the jinrikisha, and was impressed by the fine homes in the foreign section of Yokohama. After an overnight stay at Yokohama, she enjoyed "immensely" the train journey to Tokyo, riding in an English-style box

carriage through a "simply charming" landscape. Arriving at the school by jinrikisha a little after one, Wintemute was greeted by the more than 130 enrolled pupils and then taken to her room:

I may say...it is beyond my expectations; and I am sure that if all the ladies at home could see it they would be well satisfied and glad they had gone to the expense. There is a beautiful view, from the front balcony of the third story, of the ocean in the distance, with the surrounding hills and the slope between dotted with buildings. Looking at the city from there you would think it was built in the middle of a lovely forest.

After more enthusiastic comment, Wintemute concluded: "I hope you will not get tired reading this letter. You must tell me if the letters are not interesting, and I shall be glad to shorten them. AGGIE"

Wintemute worked at Toyo Eiwa for almost three years, teaching arithmetic, English, physical education, and sewing.⁶⁸ (She moved to Kofu in 1889, at age 25, as founding principal of the Yamanashi Eiwa school, and was thus not a witness to the murder of Alfred Large.) During her time at Toyo Eiwa, Wintemute updated the readers of *Missionary Outlook* regularly on the pupils' and her own progress. Her comments, concrete and good-humored, reflected an even-tempered sense of her own limitations and an appreciation of the intercultural exchanges offered by her work in Japan. In early summer 1887, after about nine months in Japan, Wintemute attended a service at the boys' school in which six boys, six Toyo Eiwa girls, and one "quite old lady" were baptized: "It was a very interesting service, although I could not understand much of what was said."⁶⁹ By contrast, her pupil, Yoshi Hasegawa was "a perfect little marvel at learning English, and she does very well in her music also...I think you can make her under-

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

stand almost anything you want." On August 11, 1887, while summering in Karuizawa ("*Usui Yoge, Usui Gori Machi, Gumba Ken*"), Wintemute reviewed her year of service with characteristic optimism.⁷⁰

Day by day I have learned new lessons; and I am sure that the knowledge I myself have received, is tenfold more than what I have imparted to others....There have been trials, different in kind to those I had expected, yet none the less hard to bear; but the pleasures have been so many more that I would rather speak of them. The work in the schoolroom has been very pleasant indeed, especially the last term, which I enjoyed exceedingly.

The unexplained trials to which Wintemute referred may have included the negative rumors that had circulated in the missionary community about Eliza Spencer and Alfred Large, who had been married in the previous month. Wintemute had defended the couple, writing in her diary: "I really did not think that Christian people could be capable of getting up such detestable gossip as I have reason to believe from to-day's disclosures is being started in this compound."⁷¹ After less than a year in the field, Wintemute was already showing the independent thinking and critical attitude toward missionary culture that was to characterize her later life.

Wintemute's career as WMS representative ended in 1893 with her own marriage in Canada to Harper Havelock Coates (1865-1934), a General Board missionary who had taught at the Toyo Eiwa boys' school since arrival in Japan in 1892.⁷² Unlike Spencer, who was considered so important to the mission that the WMS had continued her employment at Toyo Eiwa after marriage, Agnes Wintemute Coates returned to Japan in 1894 as the unpaid spouse of a General Board missionary, bearing the expectation of the

Methodist community that she would participate in evangelical work on a voluntary basis. There is no indication that Coates at this point resented the different treatment she had received relative to Large. In fact, the two had fallen out of friendship even before the Coates wedding, and their relationship became increasingly bitter during the Imbroglio: Large led the charge for the WMS women, while the new Mrs. Coates was identified with the men.⁷³

But Agnes's life was to take more unexpected turns. During her first decade or more of marriage, she carried out the duties of missionary wife with enthusiasm. After his work at the boys' school ended in 1895, Harper worked until 1905 at the Methodist Central Tabernacle in Hongo, taught philosophy at Aoyama Gakuin from 1905 to 1916, and then resumed evangelistic work from a base in Hamamatsu until his death in 1934. For her part, Agnes held mothers' meetings, conducted cooking and sewing classes, wrote articles, and taught Sunday School – all the while raising her six children, born between 1895 and 1906.⁷⁴ In 1902, in order to provide education for her growing family, she helped to found a small school that was later to become The American School in Japan.⁷⁵ Gradually, however, Agnes became frustrated with the Mission Board's unwillingness to recognize her contribution in more tangible ways, including financial assistance for the children's education.⁷⁶ For economic and emotional reasons, she took the children to Canada in 1913 and stayed for five years while they attended school. She lived outside Japan again from 1921 to 1926, inviting much criticism from the Japan missionary community for abandoning Harper and the mission work.

The move away from Japan marked the beginning of a series of separations and new departures for Agnes Coates. She sought emotional

distance from Harper, and the couple inhabited separate worlds even when she was in Japan.⁷⁷ Harper continued his evangelical work from Hamamatsu; Agnes taught English and domestic science at various schools, mostly in Tokyo, while at the same time pursuing a growing interest in nutrition.⁷⁸ Her aim was to improve the Japanese diet by incorporating good aspects of Western nutrition. (For many years she worked hard to promote the use of peanuts and peanut butter.) The work in nutrition was a prototype for her larger goal: the promotion of mutual understanding between East and West. As early as 1919, Agnes had written to her son Willson: "I feel like devoting myself to that with the same earnestness & devotion that Papa feels about his preaching."⁷⁹

The family and associates of Agnes and Harper Coates were most shocked by the spiritual transformation that underpinned her new interests. The couple had long shared an appreciation of non-Christian religions. In 1930, as he approached the end of his career, Harper published a well-respected study of the Buddhist monk Honen. Following his wishes, a Buddhist memorial service was held in 1935 to mark the first anniversary of his death. Willson Coates insisted, however, that Harper never doubted the superiority of Christianity over other faiths.⁸⁰ Agnes moved further than her husband, separating herself in turn from missionary activities, from Methodism, and eventually from mainstream Christianity itself. In the mid-1920s, after exploring new and unorthodox ideas such as New Thought and Theosophy, she joined the little-known Sabian Assembly, a California-based group that contained elements of both.⁸¹ How long or how actively she associated with the Sabian Assembly is unclear, but her family and friends believed that she had rejected Christianity. The missionary community in Japan mistak-

enly thought that she had joined the Baha'i faith.⁸²

After Harper died in 1934, Agnes Coates moved to Tokyo in order to concentrate on her work in nutrition. She maintained her decades-long association with the journalist-educator Hani Motoko (1873-1957) and taught for some time at Jiyu Gakuen, the progressive school founded by Hani and her spouse Yoshikazu. Increasingly, however, Coates identified herself uncritically with Japan and Japanese culture. As international concern grew over Japan's military expansion in China, Coates, despite her pacifist convictions, attempted to explain and defend Japan to friends, family and mission associates.⁸³ After the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbor, she decided, against the wishes of her children, to remain in Japan in order to help create an atmosphere conducive to peace. Coates assured her daughter Carol that "there is no place where they take as good care of their aged as in Japan."⁸⁴ For a while, Japanese friends helped her get food and other necessities, but as the war dragged on, she was placed under surveillance and the sources of support faded. Despite further appeals by her children, communicated through the Red Cross, to leave Japan, Coates remained. Her health broken by the wretched living circumstances, she died in June 1945 at the age of 81 in a temporary hospital in the grounds of the Nikolai Cathedral in Tokyo.⁸⁵

VI. Conclusion

This paper has offered vignettes of three Canadian women – Martha Cartmell, Eliza Spencer Large, and Agnes Wintemute Coates – who traveled to Japan in the 1880s as paid representatives of the Canadian WMS. For about half a year from September 1886, all three lived and worked together at Toyo Eiwa Jogakko in Azabu. All made an important contribution to

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

the establishment of girls' Christian education in modern Japan. The experiences of these women can be fruitfully examined from various perspectives, including gender studies, the history of religion, and the history of girls' education in Japan. The focus of this paper, however, is on the personal costs of international missionary work for the three women.

As they embarked upon their careers in Japan, Cartmell, Large, and Coates had much in common. All were middle-class Ontario women, better educated than most Canadian women of their day and with professional training and experience as teachers. More importantly, all three were intelligent, thoughtful, and keenly religious women who believed they had been called by God to evangelize the Japanese people through the education of girls. At Toyo Eiwa Jogakko, Cartmell, Large, and Coates were engaged in a shared enterprise that brought similar challenges and rewards. At a personal level, each had to set about learning Japanese, adapting to a foreign culture, enduring separation from family and homeland, and making new friendships and relationships in the Japan mission community. There were also significant professional challenges and opportunities, even for a veteran educator such as Cartmell. Not only did they teach a range of subjects to their non-native English speaking pupils, but each served as school principal, Cartmell and Large at Toyo Eiwa and Coates at Yamanashi Eiwa. A final common point is that, for each of these women, the end of their missionary career by no means marked the end of purposeful activity. Decades of life experience followed.

It was in the years after their WMS service that the life courses of the three women, once neatly parallel, diverged sharply. By disposition, Cartmell was not well suited to overseas missionary work. She struggled against psychologi-

cal illness during her two periods of service in Japan and even after her retirement faced continuing health problems. Honored and sustained by her church friends, however, Cartmell filled the remainder of her long life with activities on behalf of WMS and the Japan mission. Eliza Spencer Large was less fortunate. For the all-too-brief duration of her marriage, she experienced what most women of her generation could not: a loving husband, a baby daughter, and a well-paying, professional position. But the reversal in her circumstances was extreme: Alfred's murder in 1890 left her psychologically scarred and the single mother of a one-year-old child. In subsequent feuds with the General Board missionaries, she became the target of harsh criticism and gossip. Her recall from WMS service in 1895 took away not only income but also the professional and social responsibilities that had so energized her. That Large spent her final years as a Pennsylvania fruit farmer suggests the downward spiral of her life after Toyo Eiwa Jogakko. Finally, Agnes Wintermute Coates absorbed important lessons of intercultural exchange as WMS representative at Toyo Eiwa and went on to develop an interest in non-Christian religions and non-Western cultural practices. In the process, the woman who had left paid WMS service for marriage, six children, and voluntary participation in Methodist missionary activities gradually separated herself from all of them. From the 1930s, Coates identified so strongly with Japanese culture that she felt compelled to defend Japanese military aggression in China. Following the Pearl Harbor attacks, she chose to spend the war years in Japan, ignoring pleas from her children to leave. Her lonely death in Tokyo in the closing months of the war underscored the extent of her alienation from family, faith, and homeland.

Some recent studies of Canadian missionary

women have stressed the emancipating role of paid overseas work. While recognizing the difficulties faced by WMS representatives, Rosemary R. Gagan wrote of women's missionary work as "a vehicle for their liberation," arguing that it provided a "singular opportunity for ambitious unmarried Canadian women who preferred, either permanently or temporarily, a professional career to the Victorian ideal of domesticity."⁸⁶ Ridout quoted a more nuanced characterization that sees overseas missionary experience as "a complex pattern of opportunity and constraint."⁸⁷ The life stories of Cartmell, Large and Coates suggest that it is prudent not to overestimate the liberating qualities of missionary experience. While work in an international environment such as Toyo Eiwa Jogakko offered valuable opportunities and rewards, it could also be a demanding, stressful and even traumatic experience that disrupted lives and propelled them in sharply different directions.

Did the difficulties faced by Cartmell, Large, and Coates reflect primarily their individual circumstances, or were broader factors in play? Responding to the experiences of their Japan-based missionary personnel, Canadian Methodists developed a narrative that emphasized the particular, though little recognized, difficulties presented by Japan, their first overseas mission field. In July 1893, M. Abbie Veasey, who was nearing the end of her first year's service, wrote of the difficulties of adjusting to Japanese life:⁸⁸

We find ourselves at our coming landed on the other side of the globe and, as it were, upon our heads....So many of our cherished ideas must suffer a complete revolution. For instance, at home we are "the people" and all other nations are to us "foreigners." Here, behold, we find ourselves the "foreigners" while the hitherto foreign

Japanese have become "the people," which fact is daily emphasized as we go about the streets....

We hear so much at home about the refinement of the Japanese people-the picturesqueness of their homes and costumes and, above all, of their cleanliness as a race. We arrive here to find, not that there is no culture or refinement it is true, but that it exists very exclusively among the wealthier upper classes of society....

...We find that the people of this land are not, as a general thing, waiting with outstretched hands for the gospel. There is much dislike and distrust of the foreigner to be met and overcome....We are from the beginning on the outside of the Japanese life, and to a certain extent must be content to remain so.

In 1905, while expressing pride and guarded optimism regarding the missionary effort in Japan, the Canadian Methodist Arthur P. Addison did not gloss over the difficulties in his history of the Methodist mission work in Japan. After noting the "waves of destructive criticism" against Christianity and the uncertainties of a yet-unresolved Russo-Japanese war, Addison returned to the particular challenges for missionaries who are "away from home, from the inspiration of their friends and their councils, from the cheer of the mother-tongue, save in their own homes, surrounded by heathenism, with its heart-sickening sights and sounds, in a climate very enervating and hard on the nerves."⁸⁹ On the physical and cultural climate, Addison borrowed the words of former missionary Eby to explain:⁹⁰

When you come to live in that country (Japan) you feel that in the atmosphere, with its lack of ozone, and among the people, you are giving out all the time, of body

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange:
The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

and mind and soul and morals, your strength of every kind – is [in?] an everlasting breathing out and out and getting nothing in from any source whatever.

The message of Japan as a difficult environment for foreign missionaries was expressed even more clearly by Harriet Platt in her telling of the history of the WMS missionaries:⁹¹

Of Japan as a mission field much has been written that is true, and yet not the whole truth. It is claimed that this is the most desirable mission field in the world; that life and property are as safe there as at home; that the climate is delightful, the people civilized, polite and kindly; that there are no hardships or privations; that a halo of romance surrounds the work. This may all be true; our missionaries do not complain; but, strange to say, the only one of our missionaries that ever suffered from the hand of an assassin and would-be safe robber, is the Japan Mission. The climate is fine, but to the foreign missionary it is enervating. The atmosphere lacks something that Canadians need. One of our missionaries was heard to remark, "I never seemed to get a good full breath while I was in Japan."

Japan is the home of the earthquake, the typhoon, the tidal wave, and all the erratic forces of nature. All these things, with the strain of over-work, make havoc of health and nerves, and more of our missionaries have returned with shattered health from that field than from any other.

As others in the early 20th century missionary world recognized, however, the hardships faced by the WMS representatives could not be attributed solely to personal misfortune or the particular challenges of Japan. In 1932, an international and interdenominational review of Christian missions led by the eminent philosopher and

religious scholar William Ernest Hocking suggested that the difficulties encountered by WMS missionaries in Japan could be found in mission fields across the globe. Missionaries were urged to make efforts to avoid personality clashes and to look out carefully for psychological disorders. Hocking urged higher salaries, better training, proper rest time, and proper provision for the education of children. On unmarried missionaries, Hocking wrote:⁹²

The unmarried woman missionary presents a special problem. Many of them represent the highest values in the missionary field, and in general they appear to be contented in their work and healthfully adjusted to their environment. Even a superficial observation, however, reveals the fact that breakdown from emotional crises, the development of neurasthenic states, and even more serious disturbances are by no means infrequent.

Some of the causes which lead to those conditions are obvious. The abnormality of the missionary's life in a foreign land is accentuated, in the case of the unmarried woman, by the lack of family ties and domestic responsibilities on the one hand, and of the social and recreational outlets of the professional woman in America on the other. There is little to shift the focus of her attention from routine mission work, and the consequence is a tendency to become mission-centric in a dangerous degree.

Hocking's comments suggest that the difficulties faced by Cartmell, Large, and Coates in their Japan service were by no means unusual in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. They also presaged the radical rethinking of employment conditions for women missionaries and the nature of the mission movement itself that developed across the world in the postwar era.

- ¹ In particular, the records of the Tokyo Board of Directors and copies of the letters and reports that appeared in *Missionary Outlook*, a magazine published by the Methodist Church in Canada from 1881 to 1925.
- ² United Church of Canada Archives (UCA), box 2, Board of Management, 1881-1918; Annual and Executive, 1881-1906.
- ³ Kanada Fujin Senkyōshi Monogatari Hensan Inkaï (ed.), *Kanada fujin senkyōshi monogatari* カナダ婦人宣教師物語 (Gakko Hojin Toyo Eiwa Jogakuin, 2010); Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin Hyakunenshi Hensan Jikkō Inkaï (ed.), *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi* 東洋英和女学院百年史 (Toyo Eiwa Jogakuin, 1983); Toyo Eiwa Jogakkō Gojūnenshi Hensan Inkaï 東洋英和女学校五十年史 編纂委員会 (ed.), *Toyoeiwa Jogakkō gojūnenshi* 東洋英和女学校五十年史 (Toyo Eiwa Jogakko, 1934).
- ⁴ Harriet L. Platt, *The Story of the Years: A History of the Woman's Missionary Society of the Methodist Church, Canada, 1881 to 1906*, Vol.1: Canada and Vol. 2: Beyond Seas (Toronto: Woman's Missionary Society of the Methodist Church of Canada, 1908-09); Arthur P. Addison, *The Heart of Japan* (Toronto: The Methodist Young People's Forward Movement for Missions, 1905); The Missionaries of the United Church of Canada in Japan, *Fruits of Christian Missions in Japan* (Toronto: The Woman's Missionary Society of the United Church of Canada, 1930).
- ⁵ Especially Rosemary R. Gagan, *Sensitive Independence: Canadian Methodist Women Missionaries in Canada and the Orient, 1881-1925* (McGill-Queen's University Press, 1992); Katherine Ridout, "A Woman of Mission: The Religious and Cultural Odyssey of Agnes Wintemute Coates," *Canadian Historical Review*, 71:2 (1990), pp. 208-44.
- ⁶ *The Story of the Years*, vol. 1, pp. 13-27; Gagan, pp. 9-25.
- ⁷ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, no page number.
- ⁸ Gagan, pp. 4-5.
- ⁹ A Hamish Ion, *The Cross and the Rising Sun: The Canadian Protestant Missionary Movement in the Japanese Empire, 1872-1931* (Wil-

- frid Laurier University Press: 1990), pp. 18-34; Gwen R. P. Norman, "One Hundred Years in Japan" (unpub., 1979), pp. 64-65; *The Heart of Japan*, pp. 57-74, 153-55, 190-91; *Fruits of Christian Missions in Japan*, pp. 34-42, 69-70; *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, pp. 1-16.
- ¹⁰ *The Story of the Years*, vol. 2, p. 7.
- ¹¹ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, p. 8.
- ¹² *The Story of the Years*, p. 165.
- ¹³ The social analysis of the WMS missionary recruits is based on Gagan, pp. 26-64.
- ¹⁴ As early as May 1884, a poem entitled "A Plea for Japan" that appeared in the Methodist magazine *Missionary Outlook* (4:5, p. 74) called for contributions to the Japan missionary effort as follows: "They are dwelling, Lord, uncared for / In the far-off Asian seas / The women and the children / Of the cultured Japanese. / Tho' learned in art and science, / Deft of hand, and clear of brain / Knowing not their Creator, / Other knowledge all is vain."
- ¹⁵ Gagan, pp. 21-23.
- ¹⁶ *Outlook*, vol. 2:11 (November 1882).
- ¹⁷ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, p. 10. Mrs. Clark may have been Mrs. H. Clarke, of Hamilton. The Board of Management (also called the Board of Managers) consisted of about 12 WMS members who met several times a year to oversee the work of the WMS, including the appointment of missionary representatives and handling of finances.
- ¹⁸ *Kanada fujin senkyōshi monogatari*, pp. 18-31; *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, p. 48.
- ¹⁹ Gagan, pp. 64-66; Norman, p. 65.
- ²⁰ Gagan, p. 66.
- ²¹ On Cartmell's early activities, culminating in the establishment of Toyo Eiwa, see *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, pp. 16-23; *Kanada fujin senkyōshi monogatari*, pp. 22-24; *The Story of the Years*, vol. 2, pp. 7-10; and *Fruits of Christian Missions*, 70-71.
- ²² *The Story of the Years*, vol. 2, p. 9.
- ²³ *The Story of the Years*, vol. 2, pp. 9-10.
- ²⁴ *The Story of the Years*, vol. 2, p. 9.
- ²⁵ *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, pp. 23-28; Norman, pp. 67-68; *The Cross and the Rising Sun*, pp. 126-29. In 1899 the Methodist mission gave up its control of the Toyo Eiwa boys' school

Toyo Eiwa Jogakko as a Site of International Exchange: The Experiences of Three Canadian Methodist Women

as a result of restrictions on the teaching of religion in schools.

²⁶ *Missionary Outlook* (5:12, Dec. 1885), p. 186. See Norman, pp. 67-68.

²⁷ *Missionary Outlook* (5:10, Oct. 1885), p. 156.

²⁸ Archives of Toyo Eiwa Jogakuin, Minutes of the Tokyo Board of Directors.

²⁹ Archives of Toyo Eiwa Jogakuin. See also Norman, pp.103-08. The pre-college program was ended in 1918, when the establishment of the Tokyo Woman's Christian University offered Toyo Eiwa graduates the opportunity for higher education.

³⁰ P. 8.

³¹ P. 71.

³² *The Story of the Years*, vol. 2, p. 20. See also Gagan, pp. 66-67, 71-72.

³³ *Missionary Outlook* (5: 1, Jan. 1885), pp. 6-8.

³⁴ *Missionary Outlook* (5: 1, Jan. 1885), p. 7.

³⁵ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, p. 4; *Missionary Outlook*, 5:1 (Jan. 1885), p. 7. Maud Cochran, daughter of the Rev. Cochran and a Tokyo resident, was also asked to work at the school.

³⁶ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, p. 161, p.172; *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, p. 49.

³⁷ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, p. 175.

³⁸ *Missionary Outlook*, 6:2 (Feb. 1886), p. 29.

³⁹ *Missionary Outlook*, 6:2 (Feb. 1886), p. 29.

⁴⁰ *Missionary Outlook*, 6:2 (Feb. 1886), p. 30.

⁴¹ *Missionary Outlook*, 5:6-7 (June-July 1885), p. 101.

⁴² *Missionary Outlook*, 6:3 (Mar. 1886), p. 44.

⁴³ *Missionary Outlook* 6:5 (May 1886), p. 75.

⁴⁴ *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, pp. 52-55. See the profile in *Kanada fujin senkyōshi monogatari*, pp. 32-39.

⁴⁵ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, pp. 87-88.

⁴⁶ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, p. 180; Gagan, pp. 83-84.

⁴⁷ *The Japan Weekly Mail* April 12, April 19, April 26, May 10, and May 17, 1890; *Missionary Outlook*, 10:6 (June 1890), pp. 83-84; *The Story of the Years*, pp. 24-27. The original romanization ("desuka") is retained. The version of the story recounted in *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, pp. 55-58, differs significantly in the details but concurs on Eliza's injuries and steady courage.

⁴⁸ *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, pp. 57-58, links the downturn in enrolments not simply to

the Large incident but also to the general anti-foreign sentiment of the time; *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakkō gojūnenshi*, p. 113.

⁴⁹ *The Heart of Japan*, pp. 90-91; John W. Saunby, *Japan: The Land of the Morning* (Toronto: William Briggs, 1895), p. 298.

⁵⁰ *The Story of the Years*, pp. 15-16.

⁵¹ Gagan, p. 85.

⁵² Gagan, pp. 86-87.

⁵³ P. 27.

⁵⁴ The sanitarium was founded by Henry Foster, a doctor and devout Methodist, who had developed an idiosyncratic treatment regime for missionaries suffering nervous exhaustion. Gagan, p. 87, describes the treatment.

⁵⁵ As the wife of a General Board missionary, Norman, pp. 166-78, offers a detailed account that is somewhat sympathetic to the men and explains the more complex issues facing the General Board. Gagan's account, pp. 84-96, is more sympathetic to the WMS women.

⁵⁶ Quoted in Norman, pp. 170-71.

⁵⁷ Quoted in Gagan, p. 90.

⁵⁸ *Missionary Outlook*, 14:7 (July 1894), p. 107.

⁵⁹ *The Story of the Years*, p. 29.

⁶⁰ Norman, p. 176.

⁶¹ Norman, p. 176; Gagan, pp. 94-96.

⁶² UCA, biographical file, Eliza Spencer.

⁶³ See background biographical information on Wintemute in Ridout, pp. 208-14.

⁶⁴ UCA, box 2, vol. 1, p. 134.

⁶⁵ In *Missionary Outlook* 7:10 (October 1887), p.152, she refers to the worries.

⁶⁶ 6:12 (December 1886), p. 188.

⁶⁷ *Missionary Outlook*, 6:12 (December 1886), pp. 188-89.

⁶⁸ *Tōyō Eiwa Jogakuin hyakunenshi*, p. 61; Ridout, pp. 217-19.

⁶⁹ *Missionary Outlook* 7:9 (September 1887), p.134.

⁷⁰ *Missionary Outlook* 7:10 (October 1887), pp.151-52. The mis-transcribed address follows the original.

⁷¹ Quoted by Gagan, p. 84.

⁷² Ridout, pp. 220-22.

⁷³ Gagan, 93-94, notes that Large had ungraciously returned her invitation to the Coates wedding

and later insisted that Coates was trying to turn the other women against her.

⁷⁴ Ridout, pp. 222-23.

⁷⁵ Ray and Vicky Downs, *The American School in Japan: A History of Our First Century* (The American School in Japan, 2003), pp. 5-18, pp. 24-25.

⁷⁶ Ridout, pp. 224-27; Norman, p. 302.

⁷⁷ Norman, p. 393; Ridout, pp. 229-30.

⁷⁸ Ridout, pp. 229-32.

⁷⁹ Quoted by Ridout, p. 232.

⁸⁰ Norman, p. 393.

⁸¹ Ridout, pp. 237-42.

⁸² Norman, p. 80, reflects this assumption.

⁸³ Ridout, p. 235.

⁸⁴ Norman, pp. 393-94. Ridout, pp. 233-34, has an unrealistically optimistic account of this period.

⁸⁵ A. Hamish Ion, *The Cross in the Dark Valley: The Canadian Protestant Movement in the Japanese Empire, 1931-1945* (Wilfrid Laurier University Press: 1990), p. 315.

⁸⁶ P. 4.

⁸⁷ P. 209.

⁸⁸ *Missionary Outlook*, 13:9 (September 1893), p. 141.

⁸⁹ *The Heart of Japan*, p. 182.

⁹⁰ *The Heart of Japan*, p. 181.

⁹¹ *The Story of the Years*, pp. 15-16.

⁹² *Re-thinking Missions: A Laymen's Inquiry after One Hundred Years*, (Harper and Brothers, 1932), pp. 299-300. See the analysis by Gagan, pp. 204-206.